



January 30, 2001

Mr. Leonard W. Peck, Jr.
Assistant City Attorney
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 13084, Capitol Station
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2001-0350

Dear Mr. Peck:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 143716.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for all documents regarding a report of a specific incident involving a use of force. You claim that most of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, and 552.131 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

As a preliminary matter, we note that the department has apparently neither mentioned nor submitted for our review information responsive to the request for a copy of the department's "Use of Force Plan." Because the department has not submitted information responsive to this particular request-item, we have no basis for finding such information confidential. Thus, we have no choice but to order release of such information, to the extent it exists within the department's possession, per section 552.302. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *see also* Gov't Code § 552.022(a). If the department believes that such information is confidential and may not lawfully be released, the department must challenge this ruling in court as outlined below.

Section 552.131(a) relating to department inmates states:

Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029, information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Section 552.029 states:

Notwithstanding . . . Section 552.131, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Section 552.131 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. Under section 552.029, basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an alleged crime involving an inmate, and an incident involving the use of force is subject to required disclosure. The submitted documents pertain to an incident involving the use of force against a department inmate. Accordingly, while the department must generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.131, it must release basic information regarding this incident pursuant to section 552.029(8). Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident.

Because you acknowledge that section 552.029(8) requires the department to release the basic information about the use of force, section 552.131 is dispositive of this matter. Consequently, it is not necessary to address your other arguments.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the

¹We note that on January 21, 2000, the TDCJ board met and, acting under the authority of the final judgment in *Ruiz v. Estelle*, determined that "the term 'Sensitive Information' shall include all information regarding TDCJ-ID offenders not required to be disclosed pursuant to Section 552.029, Government Code." See *Ruiz v. Estelle*, 503 F. Supp. 1265 (S.D. Tex. 1980), *aff'd in part and rev'd in part*, 679 F.2d 1115, *amended in part and vacated in part, reh'g denied*, 688 F.2d 266 (5th Cir. 1982), *cert. denied*, 460 U.S. 1042 (1983). Thus, the board has determined that information that is within one of the categories delineated in section 552.029 of the Government Code is not "sensitive information" that the department may withhold from the public under section 552.107(2) in conjunction with the *Ruiz* decision.

full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the General Services Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



E. Joanna Fitzgerald
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EJF/er

Ref: ID# 143716

Encl: Submitted documents

cc: Mr. Joe M. Aboul Hosn
1013 Cavender Drive
Hurst, Texas 76053
(w/o enclosures)